

# Rating Action: Moody's Public Sector Europe changes outlook on 21 Italian subsovereigns to negative; downgrades city of Venice

Global Credit Research - 13 Dec 2016

London, 13 December 2016 -- Moody's Public Sector Europe (MPSE) has today taken rating actions on 22 Italian sub-sovereigns.

MPSE has changed the outlooks to negative from stable on 21 rated Italian sub-sovereigns. MPSE also changed its extraordinary support assumptions for Italian regions to strong from moderate, on the basis of an increased degree of interventions in regional matters.

At the same time, MPSE has downgraded the issuer and debt ratings of the city of Venice to Baa3 from Baa2 and changed the outlook to negative from stable.

Today's rating action follows the outlook change to negative from stable on the Italian government's Baa2 debt rating. For further information on the sovereign rating action, please refer to Moody's press release dated 7th December 2016 (http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PR\_358690)

Please click on this link for the List of Affected Credit Ratings: http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PBC\_193622. This list is an integral part of this Press Release and identifies each affected issuer.

### **RATINGS RATIONALE**

## RATIONALE FOR THE NEGATIVE OUTLOOKS ON THE RLGs

The change of outlooks to negative from stable in the regional and local governments (RLGs) is based on the operational, financial and institutional linkages between the sovereign and sub-sovereign sectors.

## Operational and Financial Linkages

Regions and cities are largely dependent on sovereign transfers and are exposed to sovereign decisions. The central government provides certain levels of funding through a mix of transfers and retained fiscal revenues, which approximately correspond to 75% of regions' total revenues. Every year, the government defines the level of resources of the National Healthcare Fund and the National Transportation Fund. The central government is the main RLGs' creditor. The Italian Ministry of Finance and the state-backed bank Cassa Depositi e Prestiti S.p.A. (Baa2, Negative) hold about 81% of RLGs debt, a share that we expect to increase.

#### Strong Institutional Linkages

The central government exerts strong influence on regional and local financial policies. Starting from 2007, Italian regions and cities have been significantly involved by the central government in the public finance consolidation process. Particularly, the central government has focused on consolidating RLGs' budgets, reducing their debt levels and improving their accounting policies via numerous legislations.

# RATIONALE FOR THE NEGATIVE OUTLOOKS ASSIGNED TO GOVERNMENT-RELATED ISSUERS

The negative outlooks on the ratings of Cassa del Trentino S.p.A. (A3, Negative) and MM S.p.A. (Baa2, Negative) reflect the corresponding outlook changes of their respective support providers, the Autonomous Province of Trento (A3, Negative) and the City of Milan (Baa2, Negative). The ratings of both government-related issuers are at the same level as their respective support providers under the credit substitution approach given their strong operational, financial and statutory linkages.

# RATIONALE FOR THE DOWNGRADE OF THE CITY OF VENICE

The downgrade to Baa3 from Baa2 reflects Venice's:

(i) Progressive liquidity depletion occurred in the recent past, mainly driven by structural payment delays from municipal affiliates.

- (ii) Limited residual revenue raising flexibility. Venice used most of its revenue flexibility by increasing a mix of taxes in the last few years to balance the budget.
- (iii) Pressures coming from the management of municipal companies.

The Baa3 rating is takes into consideration the a strong GOB as a percentage of operating revenue (7.2% average 2011-15), although somehow volatile and the high debt burden at 123% of operating revenues in 2016, which we expect to continue declining going forward.

## WHAT COULD CHANGE THE RATING UP/DOWN

Regional and Local Governments, given the negative outlook, an upward rating change is unlikely. The outlook may revert to stable for all affected RLGs if the outlook on the sovereign's rating were to hypothetically change back to stable, provided that there is not any deterioration in RLGs' key financial or debt metrics. Conversely, the ratings for all affected regional and local governments would face downward pressure if, hypothetically, the sovereign rating were to be downgraded. Furthermore, any deterioration in financial or debt metrics may lead to downward rating pressures.

In the case of Venice, the negative outlook also reflects idiosyncratic pressures. Structural improvements in the liquidity position and a continuous decline in debt levels could also exert upward pressure.

Conversely, Venice's rating could also be downgraded in case of further deterioration in liquidity.

Government Related Issuers, for MM S.p.A and Cassa del Trentino S.p.A., the outlooks could only revert to stable if the outlooks would stabilise on the city of Milan and the autonomous province of Trento, respectively. Conversely, the ratings could face downward rating pressure upon the hypothetical rating downgrades of their respective support providers.

The sovereign action required the publication of these credit rating actions on a date that deviates from the previously scheduled release date in the sovereign release calendar, published on www.moodys.com.

The specific economic indicators, as required by EU regulation, are not available for these entities. The following national economic indicators are relevant to the sovereign rating, which was used as an input to this credit rating action.

Sovereign Issuer: Italy, Government of

GDP per capita (PPP basis, US\$): 35,781 (2015 Actual) (also known as Per Capita Income)

Real GDP growth (% change): 0.7% (2015 Actual) (also known as GDP Growth)

Inflation Rate (CPI, % change Dec/Dec): 0.1% (2015 Actual)

Gen. Gov. Financial Balance/GDP: -2.6% (2015 Actual) (also known as Fiscal Balance)

Current Account Balance/GDP: 1.6% (2015 Actual) (also known as External Balance)

External debt/GDP: [not available]

Level of economic development: High level of economic resilience

Default history: No default events (on bonds or loans) have been recorded since 1983.

# SUMMARY OF MINUTES FROM RATING COMMITTEE

On 09 December 2016, a rating committee was called to discuss the rating of the Abruzzo, Region of; Basilicata, Region of; Campania, Region of; Cassa del Trentino S.p.A.; Liguria, Region of; Lombardy, Region of; MM S.p.A.; Molise, Region of; Naples, City of; Piedmont, Region of; Puglia, Region of; Sardinia, Autonomous Region of; Trento, Autonomous Province of; Umbria, Region of; Valle d'Aosta, Autonomous Region of; Veneto, Region of; Civitavecchia, City of; Lazio, Region of; Milan, City of; Sicily, Autonomous Region of; Venice, City of; Bolzano, Autonomous Province of. The main points raised during the discussion were: The systemic risk in which the issuers operate have materially increased. The extraordinary support from the central government has materially increased for regions. The City of Venice's fiscal or financial strength,

including its debt profile, has materially decreased.

The principal methodologies used in rating Region of Abruzzo, Region of Basilicata, Autonomous Province of Bolzano, Region of Campania, City of Civitavecchia, Region of Lazio, Region of Liguria, Region of Lombardy, City of Milan, Region of Molise, City of Naples, Region of Piedmont, Region of Puglia, Autonomous Region of Sardinia, Autonomous Region of Sicily, Autonomous Province of Trento, Region of Umbria, Autonomous Region of Valle d'Aosta, Region of Veneto, City of Venice was Regional and Local Governments published in January 2013.

The principal methodologies used in rating Cassa del Trentino S.p.A. and MM S.p.A. was Government-Related Issuers published in October 2014.

Please see the Rating Methodologies page on www.moodys.com for a copy of these methodologies.

The weighting of all rating factors is described in the methodology used in this credit rating action, if applicable.

### REGULATORY DISCLOSURES

Please click on this link <a href="http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PBC\_193622">http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PBC\_193622</a> for the List of Affected Credit Ratings. This list is an integral part of this Press Release and provides, for each of the credit ratings covered, Moody's disclosures on the following items:

- Methodologies
- Person Approving the Credit Rating
- Lead Analyst

For ratings issued on a program, series or category/class of debt, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to each rating of a subsequently issued bond or note of the same series or category/class of debt or pursuant to a program for which the ratings are derived exclusively from existing ratings in accordance with Moody's rating practices. For ratings issued on a support provider, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the credit rating action on the support provider and in relation to each particular credit rating action for securities that derive their credit ratings from the support provider's credit rating. For provisional ratings, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the provisional rating assigned, and in relation to a definitive rating that may be assigned subsequent to the final issuance of the debt, in each case where the transaction structure and terms have not changed prior to the assignment of the definitive rating in a manner that would have affected the rating. For further information please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page for the respective issuer on www.moodys.com.

For any affected securities or rated entities receiving direct credit support from the primary entity(ies) of this credit rating action, and whose ratings may change as a result of this credit rating action, the associated regulatory disclosures will be those of the guarantor entity. Exceptions to this approach exist for the following disclosures, if applicable to jurisdiction: Ancillary Services, Disclosure to rated entity, Disclosure from rated entity.

Moody's considers a rated entity or its agent(s) to be participating when it maintains an overall relationship with Moody's. On this basis Region of Lazio, City of Naples, Region of Umbria, Region of Veneto, City of Venice or their agents are considered to be participating entities. These rated entities or their agents generally provide Moody's with information for their ratings process.

The person who approved Autonomous Province of Bolzano, City of Milan, Cassa del Trentino S.p.A., MM S.p.A. credit ratings is David Rubinoff, MD-Sub-Sovereigns, Sub-Sovereign Group, 44 20 7772 5456, 44 20 7772 5454.

The person who approved Region of Abruzzo, Region of Basilicata, Region of Campania, City of Civitavecchia, Region of Lazio, Region of Liguria, Region of Lombardy, Region of Molise, City of Naples, Region of Piedmont, Region of Puglia, Autonomous Region of Sardinia, Autonomous Region of Sicily, Autonomous Province of Trento, Region of Umbria, Autonomous Region of Valle d'Aosta, Region of Veneto, City of Venice credit ratings is Mauro Crisafulli, Associate Managing Director, Sub-Sovereign Group, +39-02-9148-1100.

The relevant office for each credit rating is identified in "Debt/deal box" on the Ratings tab in the Debt/Deal List

section of each issuer/entity page of the Website.

The below contact information is provided for information purposes only. Please see the ratings tab of the issuer page at www.moodys.com, for each of the ratings covered, Moody's disclosures on the lead analyst and the Moody's legal entity that has issued the ratings.

Regulatory disclosures contained in this press release apply to the credit rating and, if applicable, the related rating outlook or rating review.

Please see www.moodys.com for any updates on changes to the lead rating analyst and to the Moody's legal entity that has issued the rating.

Please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page on www.moodys.com for additional regulatory disclosures for each credit rating.

Francesco Zambon
Analyst
Sub-Sovereign Group
Moody's Investors Service EMEA Ltd.
One Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London E14 5FA
United Kingdom
JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456
SUBSCRIBERS: 44 20 7772 5454

David Rubinoff MD - Sub-Sovereigns Sub-Sovereign Group JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456 SUBSCRIBERS: 44 20 7772 5454

Releasing Office:
Moody's Investors Service EMEA Ltd.
One Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London E14 5FA
United Kingdom
JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456
SUBSCRIBERS: 44 20 7772 5454



© 2016 Moody's Corporation, Moody's Investors Service, Inc., Moody's Analytics, Inc. and/or their licensors and affiliates (collectively, "MOODY'S"). All rights reserved.

CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, INC. AND ITS RATINGS AFFILIATES ("MIS") ARE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND CREDIT RATINGS AND RESEARCH PUBLICATIONS PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ("MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS") MAY INCLUDE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES. MOODY'S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL, FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS, INC. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL

ADVICE, AND CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. NEITHER CREDIT RATINGS NOR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR. MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS AND PUBLISHES MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO CONSIDER MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS OR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS IN MAKING ANY INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing the Moody's Publications.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY SUCH RATING OR OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from \$1,500 to approximately \$2,500,000. MCO and MIS also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of MIS's ratings and rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold ratings from MIS and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at www.moodys.com under the heading "Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."

For Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail clients. It would be dangerous for "retail clients" to make any investment decision based on MOODY'S credit rating. If in doubt you should contact your financial or other professional adviser.

For Japan only: MOODY'S Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MOODY'S Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.

MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY200,000 to approximately JPY350,000,000. MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.

Moody's Public Sector Europe is the trading name of Moody's Investors Service EMEA Limited, a company incorporated in England with registered number 8922701 that operates as part of the Moody's Investors Service division of the Moody's group of companies.